

SIMCOE COUNTY DISTRICT SCHOOL BOARD

SPECIAL BOARD MEETING

ACCOMMODATION REVIEW 2011:01

Port McNicoll Public School, Victoria Harbour Elementary School,

Waubashene Elementary School and Waubashene Pines Elementary School

THURSDAY, MAY 24, 2012 – 6:00 P.M.

A G E N D A

ROY EDWARDS ROOM

- A. (1) Roll Call
- (2) Approval of Agenda
- (3) Declaration of Conflicts of Interest

B. RECOMMENDATIONS FOR ACTION

Items for Decision

- (1) (a) Accommodation Review 2011:01 – Port McNicoll Public School, Victoria Harbour Elementary School, Waubashene Elementary School and Waubashene Pines Elementary School

C. FUTURE BUSINESS AND ADJOURNMENT

Special ARC Board Meeting (2011:02 – Coldwater Public School, Moonstone Elementary School, Warminster Elementary School) – May 30, 2012 at 6:00 p.m.
– Roy Edwards Room

**SIMCOE COUNTY DISTRICT SCHOOL BOARD
SPECIAL BOARD MEETING**

**ACCOMMODATION REVIEW 2011:01
Port McNicoll Public School, Victoria Harbour Elementary School, Waubaushene
Elementary School and
Waubaushene Pines Elementary School**

PUBLIC SESSION

RECOMMENDED ACTION – THURSDAY, MAY 24, 2012

REPORT	FYI	Decision Req.	MOTION
			Call Meeting to order. Roll Call
		√	That the agenda be approved as printed.
			Declaration of Conflicts of Interest
B-1-a Accommodation Review 2011:01 – Port McNicoll PS, Victoria Harbour ES, Waubaushene ES and Waubaushene Pines ES		√	(1) That the Board direct staff to pursue partnerships with viable financial commitments until September 30, 2013, in accordance with Board Policy 2345, Facility Partnerships, relating to the shared development/renewal and use of Port McNicoll Public School, Victoria Harbour Elementary School, Waubaushene Elementary School and Waubaushene Pines Elementary School, as set out in Report No. B-1-a, Accommodation Review 2011:01, Port McNicoll Public School, Victoria Harbour Elementary School, Waubaushene Elementary School, Waubaushene Pines Elementary School, dated May 24, 2012.
		√	(2) That the Board approve that, if viable partnerships are not secured by September 30, 2013 relating to Port McNicoll Public School that Port McNicoll Public School be closed effective June 30, 2015, as set out in Report No. B-1-a, Accommodation Review 2011:01 – Port McNicoll Public School, Victoria Harbour Elementary School, Waubaushene Elementary School, Waubaushene Pines Elementary School, dated May 24, 2012.
		√	(3) That the Board approve that, if viable partnerships are not secured by September 30, 2013 relating to Waubaushene Elementary School and Waubaushene Pines Elementary School that Waubaushene Elementary School and Waubaushene Pines Elementary School be closed effective June 30, 2015, as set out in Report No. B-1-a, Accommodation Review 2011:01 – Port McNicoll Public School, Victoria Harbour Elementary School, Waubaushene Elementary School, Waubaushene Pines Elementary School, dated May 24, 2012.

SIMCOE COUNTY DISTRICT SCHOOL BOARD
 RECOMMENDED ACTION - 2
 MAY 24, 2012

		√	(4) That the Board approve that, if viable partnerships are not secured by September 30, 2013 relating to the shared development/renewal and use of Port McNicoll Public School staff submit a capital priorities business case for pupil places to be used at Victoria Harbour Elementary School for the purpose of accommodating students resulting from the closure of Port McNicoll Public School, as set out in Report No. B-1-a, Accommodation Review 2011:01 – Port McNicoll Public School, Victoria Harbour Elementary School, Waubaushene Elementary School, Waubaushene Pines Elementary School, dated May 24, 2012.
		√	(5) That the Board approve that, if viable partnerships are not secured by September 30, 2013 relating to the shared development/renewal and use of Waubaushene Elementary School and Waubaushene Pines Elementary School, staff submit a capital priorities business case for pupil places to be used at Victoria Harbour Elementary School for the purpose of accommodating students resulting from the Waubaushene Elementary School and Waubaushene Pines Elementary School closure, as set out in Report No. B-1-a, Accommodation Review 2011:01 – Port McNicoll Public School, Victoria Harbour Elementary School, Waubaushene Elementary School, Waubaushene Pines Elementary School, dated May 24, 2012.
		√	(6) That the Board approve the commencement of an attendance area review of the three Township of Tay public elementary schools in October, 2014, as set out in Report No. B-1-a, Accommodation Review 2011:01 – Port McNicoll Public School, Victoria Harbour Elementary School, Waubaushene Elementary School, Waubaushene Pines Elementary School, dated May 24, 2012.
Future Business			
Adjournment		√	Motion to Adjourn

TO: The Chairperson and Members of the
Simcoe County District School Board

FROM: Associate Director

SUBJECT: **ACCOMMODATION REVIEW 2011:01 – PORT MCNICOLL PUBLIC SCHOOL,
VICTORIA HARBOUR ELEMENTARY SCHOOL, WAUBAUSHENE
ELEMENTARY SCHOOL, WAUBAUSHENE PINES ELEMENTARY SCHOOL**

1. **Background**

The Board approved the 2010 Capital Plan as set out in Report No. BF-D-2, Capital Plan – 2010, dated November 10, 2010 and further approved that a pupil accommodation review be undertaken commencing in September 2011, to review Port McNicoll Public School, Victoria Harbour Elementary School, Waubaushene Elementary School and Waubaushene Pines Elementary School. An Accommodation Review Committee (ARC) was established in September 2011.

The Ministry of Education issued revised Pupil Accommodation Review Guidelines in June 2009. The guidelines provide direction to boards when they are undertaking accommodation reviews to make decisions with the involvement of communities based on a broad range of criteria that address the operation and maintenance of schools effectively and efficiently and to provide quality learning experiences for students.

Board Policy 2313, Pupil Accommodation Review was revised March 24, 2010. This policy recognizes the need to assess changes in demographics, enrolment, the environment, facility condition, partnerships and the Ministry's funding model in order to provide quality learning environments to students in an efficient and effective manner. The policy's terms of reference guided the ARC and provided criteria that addressed a school's value to the student, community, the board and the local economy in the form of a School Information Profile (SIP). Terms of Reference and Reference Criteria are included as Appendix A to the policy, and Administrative Procedures Memorandum A5500, Pupil Accommodation Review, issued May 20, 2010.

2. **Process**

The Board approved initial membership for the ARC in August 2011 and as schools and municipalities continued recruitment for the ARC, an additional member was approved in December, 2011. The ARC held its first of nine working sessions on September 22, 2011.

The ARC received a SIP that provided information for each school as a reference in the process. The ARC made some minor modifications to the SIPs to enrolment and facility data, value to the student and value to the board. The committee spent considerable time clarifying the ARC process and requested additional information, beyond that provided in the SIPs. Further information and professional advice were presented by board departments Planning and Enrolment, Design, Construction and Maintenance, Finance, and the Simcoe County Student Transportation Consortium (SCSTC). The ARC also received a presentation from the Township of Tay Planning Department and Skyline Developments.

The nine working sessions provided the venue for discussion and debate regarding potential accommodation options relating to schools involved in the review. Five public meetings were held with the first being held on October 20, 2011. At these meetings the ARC process was outlined, the SIP reviewed, the activities of the ARC were shared, and opportunities for questions and feedback were made available to the public.

The final ARC report was delivered to the Director of Education on March 2, 2012 and was subsequently presented to the Board at the Special Board Meeting of March 26, 2012 (Report No. B-1-a Accommodation Review 2011:01 – Port McNicoll Public School, Victoria Harbour Elementary School, Waubaushene Elementary School, Waubaushene Pines Elementary School Accommodation Review Committee Report). The staff report, Report No. B-2-a, Accommodation Review 2011:01 – Staff Report - Port McNicoll Public School, Victoria Harbour Elementary School, Waubaushene Elementary School, Waubaushene Pines Elementary School was also received at the Special Board Meeting.

On April 10, 2012, a Special Board Meeting was held to receive delegations. The two delegations represented municipal and community interests.

The ARC process has been thorough, transparent and adheres to Board Policy No. 2313, Pupil Accommodation Review and Administrative Procedures Memorandum A5500, Pupil Accommodation Review. The ARC members, community, delegates, and students are thanked for their dedication, valuable input and overall involvement in the process.

3. Accommodation Review Committee Final Recommendations

Throughout the working sessions the ARC considered numerous options which were presented at the public meetings for feedback. After much discussion, debate, and consideration of feedback, the basis for a draft recommendation was formed. At the final working session on February 14, 2012 consensus was reached and the ARC presented their recommendation at the subsequent public meeting on February 21, 2012. As set out in Report No. B-1-a Accommodation Review 2011:01 – Port McNicoll Public School, Victoria Harbour Elementary School, Waubaushene Elementary School, Waubaushene Pines Elementary School Accommodation Review Committee Report, dated March 26, 2012, the ARC final recommendations were as follows:

- 1. Both communities have the opportunity to establish a financially viable community partnership by September 2013.*
- 2. If no facility partnership can be established, then the board builds a new school in a new location in Tay Township to be identified to accommodate students from Victoria Harbour Elementary School, Port McNicoll Public School and Waubaushene / Waubaushene Pines Elementary School.*
- 3. If funding for a new school facility is not available, and renovation funding is obtained, the ARC recommends that renovations proceed as outlined in the staff option.*
- 4. If no renovation funding is available the ARC recommends keeping all schools open and completing attendance area reviews as required to address enrolment.*

4. Staff Recommendations

An alternative accommodation option was presented to the ARC at the first working session on September 22, 2011 and to the public at the first public meeting on October 20, 2012. The option proposed closing Port McNicoll Public School, Waubaushene Elementary School and Waubaushene Pines Elementary School in June 2015 and transferring the students to Victoria Harbour Elementary School. The proposed solution included a nine room addition at Victoria Harbour Elementary School and program space enhancements (gym, library, kindergarten, etc.) to accommodate the additional students.

In finalizing staff's recommended options, the following factors were considered:

Enrolment and Accommodation
Facilities
Program delivery
Finance
Transportation
Partnerships
Demographics and Pupil Yields
Community use
Community input
Development

The staff recommendations as set in Report No. B-2-a, Accommodation Review 2011:01 – Staff Report - Port McNicoll Public School, Victoria Harbour Elementary School, Waubaushene Elementary School, Waubaushene Pines Elementary School, dated March 26, 2012, were as follows:

1. That the Board direct staff to pursue partnerships with viable financial commitments until September 30, 2013, in accordance with Board Policy 2345 – Facility Partnerships, relating to the shared development/renewal and use of Port McNicoll Public School, Victoria Harbour Elementary School, Waubaushene Elementary School and Waubaushene Pines Elementary School as set out in Report No. B-2-a, Accommodation Review 2011:01 – Staff Report - Port McNicoll Public School, Victoria Harbour Elementary School, Waubaushene Elementary School, Waubaushene Pines Elementary School, dated March 26, 2012.
2. That the Board approve that, if viable partnerships are not secured by September 30, 2013 relating to Port McNicoll Public School that Port McNicoll Public School be closed effective June 30, 2015 as set out in Report No. B-2-a, Accommodation Review 2011:01 – Staff Report - Port McNicoll Public School, Victoria Harbour Elementary School, Waubaushene Elementary School, Waubaushene Pines Elementary School, dated March 26, 2012.
3. That the Board approve that, if viable partnerships are not secured by September 30, 2013 relating to Waubaushene Elementary School and Waubaushene Pines Elementary School that Waubaushene Elementary School and Waubaushene Pines Elementary School be closed effective June 30, 2015 as set out in Report No. B-2-a, Accommodation Review 2011:01 – Staff Report - Port McNicoll Public School, Victoria Harbour Elementary School, Waubaushene Elementary School, Waubaushene Pines Elementary School, dated March 26, 2012.

4. That the Board approve that, if viable partnerships are not secured by September 30, 2013 relating to the shared development/renewal and use of Port McNicoll Public School staff submit a capital priorities business case for pupil places to be used at Victoria Harbour Elementary School for the purpose of accommodating students resulting from the closure of Port McNicoll Public School as set out in Report No. B-2-a, Accommodation Review 2011:01 – Staff Report - Port McNicoll Public School, Victoria Harbour Elementary School, Waubaushene Elementary School, Waubaushene Pines Elementary School, dated March 26, 2012.
5. That the Board approve that, if viable partnerships are not secured by September 30, 2013 relating to the shared development/renewal and use of Waubaushene Elementary School and Waubaushene Pines Elementary School, staff submit a capital priorities business case for pupil places to be used at Victoria Harbour Elementary School for the purpose of accommodating students resulting from the Waubaushene Elementary School and Waubaushene Pines Elementary School closure as set out in Report No. B-2-a, Accommodation Review 2011:01 – Staff Report - Port McNicoll Public School, Victoria Harbour Elementary School, Waubaushene Elementary School, Waubaushene Pines Elementary School, dated March 26, 2012.
6. That the Board approve the commencement of an attendance area review of the three Township of Tay public elementary schools in October, 2014 as set out in Report No. B-2-a, Accommodation Review 2011:01 – Staff Report - Port McNicoll Public School, Victoria Harbour Elementary School, Waubaushene Elementary School, Waubaushene Pines Elementary School, dated March 26, 2012.

5. Conclusions

The board endorses quality education throughout its jurisdiction while providing equity for all students in its facilities. The schools in this accommodation review currently face significant enrolment, program, and facility pressures and will continue to do so into the future.

Enrolment at these schools has declined significantly over the past decade and is expected to continue, although at a lower rate. This will result in Port McNicoll Public School and Waubaushene / Waubaushene Pines Elementary School being significantly under utilized. Consideration was given to future development in the area. Although the potential for significant numbers of new units does exist, this new development is required to slow enrolment decline and is expected, at best, to merely stabilize the current school enrolments. A consolidation of schools would address the under utilization pressures of the schools in this area.

Student program at Waubaushene / Waubaushene Pines Elementary School is being impacted by the low enrolment (current and projected) at this school. This is evidenced by the current and projected number of split and triple-grade classes and decreasing staffing allocations. Program delivery at this school is further complicated by the program being delivered on two separate sites. Port McNicoll Public School and Victoria Harbour Elementary School also continue to experience a decline in enrolment. As a result, these schools will also experience program challenges relating to decreased staff and numerous split and triple-grade classes.

A consolidation of schools will not only reduce the incidence of these classes but provide for a school of sufficient enrolment (400 – 550 students as set out in the Terms of Reference) to ensure the provision of specialized programs. A school of this size also provides the opportunity for teachers to improve learning opportunities through professional learning, and the enhancement of opportunities for students to participate in a full range of extra-curricular activities, all in a single location.

The schools involved in this pupil accommodation review also face significant facility pressures relating to renewal and accessibility requirements. To address renewal needs over the next 10 years, and to meet accessibility and building code standards, approximately \$17,368,432 in capital and renewal funding would be required for these schools. In contrast, the consolidation of Port McNicoll Public School and Waubaushene / Waubaushene Pines Elementary School with Victoria Harbour Elementary School would require capital funding approximating \$6,548,065. This would eliminate the need for significant renewal at Port McNicoll Public School and Waubaushene / Waubaushene Pines Elementary School and would also result in operations, utilities and support savings.

The ARC, and the community, spent considerable time discussing the potential for partnerships to aid in the construction of new schools and/or the renewal of existing schools in the three communities. Staff will continue to explore, for a reasonable period of time, any potential partnerships that could result in relieving the enrolment, program and facility pressures that the schools in this area face. Any potential partnerships would be required to meet the criteria set out in Board Policy 2345 – Facility Partnerships and be financially viable. Discussions with Township of Tay staff to this point have indicated a willingness on their part to explore various partnership scenarios, although partnerships requiring significant capital investment seem unlikely.

Recommendation two of the ARC report stated that if no partnership can be established that the Board would build a new school, in a new location, to accommodate the students of the elementary schools involved in this review. It was viewed that this would create a new beginning for Township of Tay students. This concept was also raised by a delegate at the Special Board Meeting of April 10, 2012. The idea was expanded to include a "*Neighbourhood Learning Centre*" model which proposed the inclusion of community, municipal, and private partnerships. A specific site was also identified as a potential location for a new Township of Tay elementary school. Staff met with Township of Tay staff to discuss the feasibility of the site and partnership possibilities. It was discovered that the lack of available servicing would make the location cost prohibitive. It was also noted, although not confirmed by an environmental study, that the physical characteristics could pose a challenge to developing the site. From a cost perspective, it is estimated that a new school of the appropriate capacity required would cost approximately \$10,870,000 to construct (excluding land acquisition). It is expected that this solution would not be successful when pursuing Ministry of Education funding due to the ability to achieve a similar outcome through the staff alternative accommodation option, which is estimated to cost approximately \$6,548,065.

It is recommended that staff pursue viable financial partnerships relating to the elementary schools within the Township of Tay. If partnerships fail to materialize that address the pressures outlined in this report, it is recommended that Port McNicoll Public School and Waubaushene / Waubaushene Pines Elementary School close, and that those students be consolidated with Victoria Harbour Elementary School. It is also recommended that staff, through the Capital Planning process, pursue capital funding to accommodate students and provide program space upgrades at Victoria Harbour Elementary School should the consolidation of these schools occur.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. That the Board direct staff to pursue partnerships with viable financial commitments until September 30, 2013, in accordance with Board Policy 2345 – Facility Partnerships, relating to the shared development/renewal and use of Port McNicoll Public School, Victoria Harbour Elementary School, Waubaushene Elementary School and Waubaushene Pines Elementary School, as set out in Report No. B-1-a, Accommodation Review 2011:01 – Port McNicoll Public School, Victoria Harbour Elementary School, Waubaushene Elementary School, Waubaushene Pines Elementary School, dated May 24, 2012.
2. That the Board approve that, if viable partnerships are not secured by September 30, 2013 relating to Port McNicoll Public School that Port McNicoll Public School be closed effective June 30, 2015, as set out in Report No. B-1-a, Accommodation Review 2011:01 - Port McNicoll Public School, Victoria Harbour Elementary School, Waubaushene Elementary School, Waubaushene Pines Elementary School, dated May 24, 2012.
3. That the Board approve that, if viable partnerships are not secured by September 30, 2013 relating to Waubaushene Elementary School and Waubaushene Pines Elementary School that Waubaushene Elementary School and Waubaushene Pines Elementary School be closed effective June 30, 2015, as set out in Report No. B-1-a, Accommodation Review 2011:01 - Port McNicoll Public School, Victoria Harbour Elementary School, Waubaushene Elementary School, Waubaushene Pines Elementary School, dated May 24, 2012.
4. That the Board approve that, if viable partnerships are not secured by September 30, 2013 relating to the shared development/renewal and use of Port McNicoll Public School staff submit a capital priorities business case for pupil places to be used at Victoria Harbour Elementary School for the purpose of accommodating students resulting from the closure of Port McNicoll Public School, as set out in Report No. B-1-a, Accommodation Review 2011:01 - Port McNicoll Public School, Victoria Harbour Elementary School, Waubaushene Elementary School, Waubaushene Pines Elementary School, dated May 24, 2012.
5. That the Board approve that, if viable partnerships are not secured by September 30, 2013 relating to the shared development/renewal and use of Waubaushene Elementary School and Waubaushene Pines Elementary School, staff submit a capital priorities business case for pupil places to be used at Victoria Harbour Elementary School for the purpose of accommodating students resulting from the Waubaushene Elementary School and Waubaushene Pines Elementary School closure, as set out in Report No. B-1-a, Accommodation Review 2011:01 - Port McNicoll Public School, Victoria Harbour Elementary School, Waubaushene Elementary School, Waubaushene Pines Elementary School, dated May 24, 2012.

6. That the Board approve the commencement of an attendance area review of the three Township of Tay public elementary schools in October, 2014, as set out in Report No. B-1-a, Accommodation Review 2011:01 - Port McNicoll Public School, Victoria Harbour Elementary School, Waubaushene Elementary School, Waubaushene Pines Elementary School, dated May 24, 2012.

Respectfully submitted by:

Janis Medysky
Associate Director

Approved for submission by:

Kathryn Wallace
Director of Education

May 24, 2012